

COLLOQUIUM AND CONSULTATION ON E-GOVERNANCE

**AT THE MAMPHEY HALL, GHANA INSTITUTE OF MANAGEMENT AND
PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (GIMPA), ACCRA GHANA**

30TH MAY – 5TH JUNE, 2004

ON THE THEME

“INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY AND GOVERNANCE”

ORGANISED BY

**THE PUBLIC SERVICES COMMISSION (GHANA)
AND THE
NATIONAL ACADEMY OF PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION (USA)**

JUNE, 2004

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

1. INTRODUCTION

- 1.1 Background
- 1.2 Purpose of the Colloquium
- 1.3 Presentations/Discussions
- 1.4 Structure of the Colloquium

2. COLLOQUIUM PROCEEDINGS

- 2.1 Ceremonial Opening Session
 - 2.1.1 Opening Remarks
 - Prof. S. N. Woode
 - Dr. Francis Agble
 - H.E. Mary Carlin Yates,
 - 2.1.2 Keynote Address
 - Hon. Albert Kan Dapaah

3. SUMMARY OF PRESENTATIONS AT THE PLENARY SESSIONS

3.1 Plenary Session 1

- “E-governance: It’s Promise and Limitations in Public Management”
 - Harvey White and Kofi Worlanyo
- “Strategic Planning for the E-governance/Information Era”
 - - Dr Costis Toregas and Dr Francis Agble

3.2 Plenary Session 2

- “E-governance as an Instrument for Services Delivery, Public Accountability and Citizen Employment”
 - - Terry Buss and Hon. David Gyewu
- “Improving Higher Education through Distance Learning”
 - - Charlie Nelms and Rev. Emmanuel K. Dadebo
- “African Executives Web-based Network for Effective Governance”
 - - Johnson Nkuuhe and Mrs. Estelle Akofio-Sowah.

4. **LUNCHEON PRESENTATION –DR. ALFRED S. FAWUNDU**
5. **SUMMARY OF REACTOR PANEL AND DISCUSSIONS/PRESENTATIONS**
6. **SUMMARY OF DISCUSSIONS AND CONSULTATIONS IN BREAK-OUT GROUPS**
 - 6.1 Group A - Governance and Sustainable Development
 - 6.2 Group B - Administrative Issues in E-Governance
 - 6.3 Group C - Strategic Planning, Local and Regional Governance
 - 6.4 Group D - Workforce Capacity Building
 - 6.5 Group E - Issues in Information Technology Management
 - 6.6 Group F - Performance Measures for Upper Management Personnel
7. **QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS SESSION**
8. **SUMMATION**
9. **CLOSING CEREMONY**
10. **APPENDICES**
 - 11.1 Workshop Programme
 - 11.2 List of Participants
 - 11.3 NAPA Social Equity Panel and Africa Working Group Members

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The Public Services Commission of Ghana and the National Academy of Public Administration of the United States, the main organisers of the colloquium, are very grateful to Hon. Albert Kan-Dapaah, Minister for Communications and Technology, and H.E. Mary Carlin Yates, United States Ambassador to Ghana, for their thought-provoking Opening Statements. Their speeches set the tone for the insightful, frank, open and lively discussions.

The contributions of all the presenters are also acknowledged: Prof. Havey White, Dr. Costis Toregas, Prof. Terry Buss, Dr. Charlie Nelms, Dr. Lenneal Henderson, Dr. Enid Beaumont, Prof Mitchell Rice, Prof. William Dodge, Dr. Sueller Keiner, Keysha Webb, Prof. Louis Picard, Prof-Michael Gordon, Paulline Greenlick, John Saunders, Harlan Hobgood, Joyce Henderson, Carolyn Graham, Melvin Foote, Francis Michalkewicz, Leah Davis, Valerie Lemmie, Cynthia Rice, Prof. George Assibey-Mensah and Dr. Charles Washington, all of NAPA.

The Ghanaian presenters were equally painstaking and thorough in their research work, and brilliant in their presentations: Dr. Francis Agble, Mr. Kofi Worlanyo, Hon. David Gyewu, Rev. Emmanuel K. Dadebo, Mrs. Estelle Akofio-Sowah, Dr. Alfred Salia Fawundu, Dr. Kofi Agyeman Badu, Mrs. Vivian Attah, Mrs. Jemima H. Quaye, Mrs. Leonora Kyerematen, Dr. Francis Appiah, Ms. Dorothy Gordon and Mrs. Esther Ofei-Aboagye. .

Prof. Samuel N. Woode of PSC and Prof. Phillip Rutledge of NAPA deserve special commendation for making the event happen.

The enthusiastic support and active participation by the co-sponsors of the colloquium and other supporting MDAs are also acknowledged with sincere gratitude.

The team of rapporteurs, comprising Mr. Mike Gabah, Mr. Kwaku Dua Dankwa, Mr. William Botchway, Mr. Dan K. Sam, Mr. Romeo Adu-Tutu and Mr. K. Obeng-Fosu, of the P.S.C., and their NAPA counterparts, are to be commended, too.

The hard work and tireless effort of members of the Planning Committees at both the PSC (Accra) and NAPA (USA) is acknowledged with thanks.

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

APRM	-	African Peer Review Mechanism
ASPA	-	American Society for Public Administration
AVU	-	African Virtual University
CDD	-	Centre for Democratic Development
Exec Net	-	African Executive Officers' Network
F & A	-	Finance and Administration
GIMPA	-	Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration
HRPD	-	Human Resource Policy Division, (PSC)
ICMA	-	International City Management Association (USA)
ICT	-	Information Communication Technology
ILGS	-	Institute of Local Government Studies (Ghana)
IT	-	Information Technology
MAN	-	Metropolitan Access Network
MCT	-	Ministry of Communication and Technology
MDAs	-	Ministries, Departments and Agencies
MES	-	Ministry of Environment and Science
MEYS	-	Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports
MFEP	-	Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
MLGRD	-	Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development
MMDE	-	Ministry of Manpower Development and Employment
MOH	-	Ministry of Health
MoU	-	Memorandum of Understanding
MSD	-	Management Services Division (PSC)
MWCA	-	Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs

NAPA	-	National Academy of Public Administration (USA)
NDPC	-	National Development Planning Commission
NEPAD	-	New Partnership for Africa's Development
NFBPA	-	National Forum for Black Public Administrators (USA)
NGOs	-	Non-Governmental Organisations
NGP	-	National Governance Programme (Ghana)
OHCS	-	Office of the Head of the Civil Service
OPM	-	Office of Personnel Management (USA)
PSC	-	Public Services Commission (Ghana)
PTI	-	Public Technology Incorporated (USA)
SEC	-	State Enterprises Commission
SPEA	-	School of Public Environmental Affairs, Indiana University (USA)

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 BACKGROUND

1.1.1 In November, 2003, the Public Services Commission (PSC) of Ghana signed a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the National Academy of Public Administration (NAPA) of Washington, D.C., United States, for the purpose of preparing proposals for joint projects in the following areas:

- Organizational development.
- Human resource development.
- Performance-based management measures.
- Strategic planning, governance systems.
- Modernization of the PSC infrastructure, such as computers etc.

1.1.2 As part of the collaborative effort, a Colloquium and Consultation on E-Governance was organized from May 30 to June 5, 2004 in Accra. The broad aim of the Colloquium was to enhance the PSC as a centre of excellence in public administration and governance.

1.1.3 The specific objectives of the Colloquium were:

- to improve management performance in the Ghana public service;
- to improve communication among agencies and levels of government;
- to facilitate distance learning by Ghana and other African public officials;
- to promote transparency and accountability in public management;
- to enhance human resource administration and social capital formation;
- to promote citizen participation in the delivery and evaluation of public services; and
- to strengthen PSC's capacity for managing sustainable development.

1.1.4 The following Ghanaian agencies were invited by the PSC to co-sponsor the Colloquium:-

- National Governance Programme (NGP);
- Ghana Institute of Management and Public Administration (GIMPA);
- Ministry of Communications and Technology;
- Ghana-India Kofi Annan Centre of Excellence in ICT;
- Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development (MLGRD);
- Centre for Democratic Development (CDD);
- Institute of Local Government Studies (ILGS);
- Ministry of Information;
- Office of the Senior Minister; and
- Office of the Head of the Civil Service

1.1.5 As part of the consultation, members of the NAPA delegation expressed the desire to meet with selected government agencies with the aim of forging similar collaborative relationships among them. The following Ministries, Departments and Agencies were, accordingly, informed about the consultation, and some of them took part in the pre-Colloquium discussions:

- Distance Learning Centre, GIMPA
- School of Administration, University of Ghana, Legon
- Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports
- State Enterprises Commission (SEC)
- Office of the Head of the Civil Service (OHCS)
- Management Services Division of OHCS
- Ministry of Health
- Office of the President
- Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning
- National Development Planning Commission
- Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs

- Office of the Senior Minister
- Ministry of Manpower Development and Employment
- Ministry of Environment and Science
- Ministry of Regional Cooperation and NEPAD

1.2 **PURPOSE OF THE COLLOQUIUM**

1.2.1 The purpose of the Colloquium and Consultation was to explore how best information technology might be used to achieve the objectives specified in paragraph 1.1.3 above, and to strengthen the NAPA/PSC collaboration envisioned in the official Partnering Agreement.

1.3 **THE STRUCTURE OF THE COLLOQUIUM**

- 1.3.1 The **Opening Ceremony** of the colloquium was characterized by opening remarks by Prof. S.N. Woode, Chairman, PSC; the United States Ambassador to Ghana, H.E. Mary Carlin Yates; the Vice Chairman of the Public Services Commission, Dr. Francis Agble; Prof. Philip Rutledge, Past President, American Society for Public Administration and Chairman of the NAPA Colloquium Delegation and Ms. Valerie Lemmie, Vice Chair of the Board of Trustees of NAPA. The Hon. Minister for Communications and Technology, Hon. Albert Kan Dapaah, gave the Keynote Address.
- 1.3.2 The ceremony was chaired jointly by Prof. Samuel N. Woode, and Dr. Valerie Lemmie.
- 1.3.3 **Plenary Presentations** by both Ghanaian and American experts on five (5) aspects/topics of e-governance were made. These were followed by Reactor Discussions/Presentations.
- 1.3.4 **Panel Presentations/Discussions** involving two NAPA delegates and two Ghanaian experts/participants for each topic.
- 1.3.5 On the second day of the Colloquium (3rd June, 2004), participants broke into six **Syndicate Groups** to discuss the following topics: Governance and Sustainable Development; Administrative Issues in E-Governance, Strategic Planning; Local and Regional Governance; Workforce Capacity Building; Issues in Information Technology Management; and Performance Measures for Upper Management Personnel.
- 1.3.6 A group of participants in on-going courses in Public Administration at GIMPA joined the Colloquium Participants in the syndicate discussions.

- 1.3.7 All the syndicate groups were oriented to the production of recommendations for follow-up action. The general discussions that followed the presentation by each group were open and lively. Suggestions were offered on the various issues raised in all the presentations made at the Colloquium and in the syndicate reports.
- 1.3.8 The Colloquium benefited greatly from the high quality of the presentations and the enthusiastic contributions of the participants.

2. **PROCEEDINGS OF THE COLLOQUIUM**

2.1 **CEREMONIAL OPENING SESSION**

2.1.1 **OPENING STATEMENT – Prof. Samuel Nunoo Woode, Chairman of the Public Services Commission**

In his Opening Statement, Prof. S.N. Woode extended to members of the NAPA delegation, a very warm welcome to Ghana. He mentioned in particular the almost 30-year relationship between him and Prof. Phil Rutledge, the leader of the NAPA delegation who, he said, had all along wanted to do something useful for Ghana.

Prof. Woode indicated that his interest in the subject matter of the colloquium, namely, E-governance, stemmed from the fact that as a public servant, he was interested in the use of electronic information and processes to improve public sector performance and, as a citizen who was interested in using Information Technology, it would enable the government meet his demand for faster, more convenient and more responsive services.

He referred to the value and relevance of e-governance, as well as the opportunities and challenges that it offers. He stressed that the expectation of both the PSC and NAPA was that through a comparative study of its application in the US and Ghana, participants would gain a practical common sense understanding of the conditions under which it works best?

2.1.2 **STATEMENT – by H.E. Mary Carlin Yates, United States Ambassador to Ghana**

Mrs. Mary Carlin Yates expressed pleasure at the invitation to attend the opening of the colloquium and to say a few words. She stated that Information Technology had the potential to create a two-way flow of participation – in one direction, that of the citizenry in their own governance; in the other, government's accountability to the citizenry.

Information Technology, she said, was playing a transformational role in Ghana, as a result of forward thinking leadership from the very top of Ghana's government. The American Embassy was proud to be able to assist the Office of the President in the establishment of the Castle website. This, together with the Internet-based outreach efforts, was an indication of how seriously the Ghana Government was going about incorporating technology to permit its citizens to stay in contact and to be informed.

In the US, simple procedures, like renewal of driving licenses or requesting for building permits, can now be handled on line, instead of waiting in line.

Furthermore, the US Office of Personnel Management (OPM) has set up an e-governance group to promote initiatives to allow the Federal Government to better address HRM issues.

These include recruitment, payroll systems and employee evaluation. Apart from resulting in efficiency and responsiveness, it has led to saving money.

In spite of the above a number of concerns have been raised. These include how to maintain the security of communication if voter registration, or even voting, takes place via the internet; how to address equity issues, since not everyone has a computer or has ready access to one, along with the ability to use it.

The issue must however not stand in the way of moving forward on e-government processes.

Ghanaians have the capacity and the desire to develop solutions to the technical and conceptual hurdles that might stand in the way of expanding e-government programmes.

The US Ambassador stated that Ghana had qualified to apply for the Millennium Challenge Account funding, an innovative process for addressing development, targeting those countries performing well under an umbrella of good governance criteria.

Concluding, she said in every Region of Ghana are young people, the greatest natural resource, who are well-positioned to help in the spread of the word and to provide the needed competence for the realization of the e-government objectives.

2.1.3 **STATEMENT - by Dr. Francis Agble, Vice Chairman, Public Services Commission**

In his statement Dr. Francis Agble said the introduction of ICT had helped to accelerate development and good governance in Ghana. The Government, through its Integrated ICT for Accelerated Development (ICT4AD) policy had demonstrated its determination to achieve information-rich and knowledge-based society in the shortest possible time.

E-governance serves not only as an enabler of administrative change, but also as a strong catalyst for organizational change. While e-government focuses primarily on providing information and transaction-type of services to "customers" of government, e-governance will likely focus increasingly on the public in its role as "citizen".

Information revolution, through technology, is changing the political and administrative processes today than in the past. Transparency is the foundation for trust and confidence in government. Citizens must believe that the government respects, upholds and abides by the rule of law and that all are on equal footing with regard to access to information and the protection of the law.

Dr. Agble asserted that Ghana needs to invest in human capital so that the skills of workers match the jobs they must perform.

Ghana should invest in people, education and training, competency, mobility, performance culture and quality of life in order to ensure that the new economy does not compound existing social problems of unemployment, social exclusion and poverty. Web-based technologies, he said, facilitate culture change by creating a workplace where data are organized across departmental boundaries so that employees have the opportunity to learn new skills and improve their competencies.

He cautioned, however, that as information revolution takes place, unintended consequences, such as information inequality, which is a problem of ethics and social stability and politics, might take place.

Government has the moral obligation to ensure that all citizens have equal access to public services, including online services, so that the number of "information have-nots" is reduced in an era of digital services. Secondly, care must be taken not to impose unnecessary legal and regulatory frameworks, as they could stifle innovation.

Dr. Agble ended by calling on the participants to reflect on the following ten questions on e-governance readiness posed in April, 2002 by the Pacific Council on International Policy:-

- Why are we pursuing e-governance?
- Do we have a clear vision and priorities for e-governance?
- What kind of e-governance are we ready for?
- Is there enough political will to lead the e-governance effort?
- Are we selecting e-governance projects in the best way?
- How should we plan and manage e-governance projects?
- How will we overcome resistance from within the government?
- How will we measure and communicate progress? How will we know if we are failing?
- What should our relationship be with the private sector?
- How can e-government improve citizen participation in public affairs?

2.14 **KEYNOTE ADDRESS – Hon. Albert Kan Dapaah, Minister for Communications and Technology**

In his Keynote Address, the Hon. Minister for Communications and Technology commended the commitment and initiative of the PSC in complementing the efforts of the Government of Ghana and his Ministry to evolve a strategy to employ ICT as a tool to improve the efficiency of delivery of government services to its citizens, in reducing the operational cost of these institutions, and in bringing government closer to the people.

He stated that ICT is now acknowledged as an agent of change. It is a pervasive feature of all societies and economies worldwide. In Ghana, it has been accepted as having the potential to promote the eradication of extreme poverty and hunger, achievement of universal primary education, promotion of gender equality and empowerment of women, reduction of child mortality, improvement in maternal health, combating HIV/AIDS, malaria and other diseases, and ensuring environmental sustainability.

The Ministry of Communications and Technology has developed a national ICT-led policy that will transport Ghana into the world of information and knowledge society. Sector-specific ICT implementation strategies are to be developed within the context of the national policy; to cover fourteen priority areas, including one for electronic government and governance.

ICT, he said, is required to bring government closer to the people and to facilitate government's decentralization policy. It requires that public servants will be innovative enough to come out with new systems to improve service delivery specific to each sector.

This calls for collaborative efforts with software developers who will need to understand the innovative systems to translate them into applicable solutions.

The Ministry of Communications and Technology has set up a sub-committee to develop an e-government and e-governance strategy. It will take into account government's service delivery to the citizens, businesses, other agencies, civil society and development partners.

A number of significant barriers that are likely to impede the successful implementation of the e-government policy include the following:-

- Setting of goals that are too ambitious for the resources available.
- Human and organizational resistance to change.
- Setting of unrealistic time-frame for the transformation of the process.
- Lack of awareness in education and information about technology and the application of ICT programmes in governance.
- Ignoring ways of addressing the organizational, technological, and associated legal complexities, such as electronic signature and security on line.
- Lack of benchmarks for quality public services and information dissemination, all occurring in a "public space"
- Lack of/or insufficient attention to overlapping or conflicting interest among governmental and private sector participating agencies.

The Government of Ghana is committed to building a robust and modern communications infrastructural system to support e-government in Ghana. In this respect, for example, the Ministry of Communications and Technology and the Ministry of Mines are pre-occupied with transforming the national fibre optic backbone into a national asset across the length and breadth of the country. It will support the provision of broadband connectivity to facilitate the use of the internet technologies to exploit ICT for better management of government relationships with citizens, businesses and other public sector bodies. It will facilitate internet and data transfer amongst the District Assemblies.

The Ministry is also involved in building networks by MDAs to enable them interface for economy of scale in usage. A high-speed fibre network, the Metropolitan Access Network (MAN) is, accordingly, being developed to provide collaborative working medium and also deliver continuous online access to government services.

A government messaging and collaborative messaging system by which registered domain names are developed for each MDA will, among other benefits, make it possible for them to develop websites that will eventually be linked to the Government Portal and, thus, simplify the dissemination of information.

Community Information Centres will be built in all the 230 constituencies with efficient communication equipment to provide ICT services in the rural communities.

The Hon Minister concluded by urging participants in the colloquium to collectively demonstrate commitment to the successful implementation of the ideas to be generated at the forum.

3. **SUMMARY OF PRESENTATIONS AT THE PLENARY SESSIONS**

(A) **PLENARY SESSION I**

Presiding: Dr. Francis Agble, Vice Chairman, PSC and Prof. Sylvester Murray, Past President, International City Management Association (ICMA).

(a) **“E-Governance: Its Promise and Limitations in Public Management” – Prof. Harvey White, Chair, PMPD**

Prof. Harvey White began his presentation by raising a fundamental issue as to whether the concept of “governance” “politics”, “management” and “development” are the same when the issue of governance is being discussed. He noted that different meanings of “governance” have been suggested by different organizations, including the World Bank.

In his view, however, the important consideration in discussing the concept, should be what is expected to be achieved.

Three approaches may be adopted in discussing e-government:

- (a) the Info-Enthusiast approach,
- (b) the Standard or Management approach; and
- (c) the Emerging Philosophy approach.

The Info-enthusiast approach embraces the belief that information technology can deliver us from virtually every social and managerial constraint we face, including those posed by organizations and institutions. The enthusiast sees the rise of an information age that culminates in a series of “endisms” ,that is, a belief in the end of things, including the press (television and mass media) and an end to universities politics, government, cities and even nation-states. According to them, in the new world order of Information Communication Technology (ICT), the individual can hack it alone with only information on his or her side.

Prof. White cautioned, however, that such over-reliance on information can lead to 6-D Vision, that is ,the highlighting of such Ds as demystification decentralization, de-nationalisation, de-specialization, dis-intermediation and de-aggregation.

The Standard or Management approach emphasizes the use of technology to help governments and administrations provide more services with fewer resources. E-governance is thus divided into four types of relationships:

- government to citizens;
- government to businesses;
- government to government; and
- government to employees .

This approach enables the government to use technology for such services as filing taxes, registering automobiles, applying for and renewing licenses, applying for building, zoning and other permits, online payment of fines, fees and government utility bills, and applying for social programmes, as well as for conducting research.

The Emerging Philosophy approach subscribes to the notion that new information and communication technologies are among the driving forces of globalization, because they bring people together and bring to decision-makers in developing countries unprecedented new tools for development, which can permit some countries to leapfrog some of the long and painful stages of development that other countries were required to go through.

Prof. White enumerated some of the emerging functions of ICT as including its application in,

- the creation of ICT Networks, e.g. among hospitals, communities and public health clinics in order to deliver services to remote areas and community: (global e-communities); and
- Community initiatives to extend education to hard-to-reach places and to provide students with compelling and effective content and the tools for learning. (e-school).

There are, however, a number of realizations about e-governance. These are that,

- it can lead to loss of jobs;
- it can be a tool for development;
- it is a moral imperative for enhancing government, a power to be used by government;
- its use is a matter of ethics and effective government; and
- it is a vehicle for human capital development.

Prof White's conclusions emphasize the following:

- the priority of e-governance is investment in human capital and the use of appropriate, not just any, Information and Communication Technology;
- Africa does not have scarcity of technology. It has a scarcity of the appropriate information technology that will lead to sustainable development; and
- collaborative partnerships are at the heart of governance-between citizens, between government and governments, and government and the private sector.

(b) **“E-Governance: Its Promise and Limitations in Public Management” – Mr. Kofi Worlanyo, ICT Consultant**

Mr. Kofi Worlanyo identified the following as e-governance:

- New channels for accessing government.
- New styles of leadership.
- Promotion of civic engagement.
- Revenue growth.
- Increased cost-effectiveness in government.

Specific limitations of e-governance include the fact that,

- E-governance is no panacea.
- E-governance will not solve all problems of government.
- E-governance cannot replace government.
- E-governance is not just about automation of existing processes, but it is about the creation of new processes and new relationships within the system of governance.
- resistance comes from within government.
- e-governance creates a number of human resources issues that are not always brought to the surface.
- civil servants may revisit the infusion of e-governance into traditional way of doing things.

- there is the fear that technology infusion will mean more work.
- there is a belief that there is little gain, professionally, from adapting to new technology and nothing to lose if one chooses to refuse to adapt to, or use, technology;
- there is the concern that new automated processes will mean fewer opportunities in government.

Mr. Worlanyo suggested that what is needed is a well-trained and motivated workforce. Trained civil servants and strong leadership are needed in order to help civil servants integrate themselves into the new ICT structure. There must be recognition of the role of collaboration and co-operation.

ICT can conflict with cultural traditions and formality. The significance of culture must, therefore, be kept in mind. Issues such as how a country has jurisdiction over the content of what comes over the Internet, how one controls offensive information, how to deal with trust and privacy have to be reckoned with.

Concluding, Mr. Kofi Worlanyo suggested that e-governance is about information and service. Technology is only a tool. E-governance holds great potential, but it is not a panacea. It requires on the part of those who use it, an appreciation of its change elements. ICT leads to better delivery of government services to citizens and improves government's interaction with businesses and citizens. E-governance is not a tool limited to rich countries, and there is no one model for e-governance, or any universal standard for e-governance readiness to employ ICT.

3.2 (a) **“Strategic Planning for the E-governance/Information Era” – Dr. Costis Toregas, President, Public Technology Incorporated**

Information Technology (IT), according to Dr. Toregas, can be defined in the following terms:

- (a) **Service Delivery Efficiency** - that is, IT presents the “single face of government” to citizens. It reflects a re-engineering imperative; it is needs-driven.
- (b) **Economic Development** - it can permit developing countries to leapfrog current progress in technology, choosing certain advantageous advancements without necessarily transitioning through the logical prerequisite stages of development.
- (c) **Democracy** - It is a tool with the potential for enhancing democracy through greater interaction with the citizenry and greater opportunities to engage and hear from the people and to provide information to the people in an efficient way.

Dr. Toregas identified the following public administration options resulting from IT -:

- empowering workers;
- decentralizing organizational operations; and shifting work to the citizens.

There is the need for the voice of the private sector to be heard in discussions on e-governance. A centralized ICT system with a unified database and server shared by all agencies that transcends the boundaries of location is also a necessity with respect to Human Resource Management.

Dr. Toregas concluded that whereas ICT is a powerful procedure for making sure that Ghana gets “there” (the future), there is the urgent need for Ghana to be creative enough to define where the “there” is.

(b) **“Strategic Planning for the E-governance/Information Era” – Dr. Francis Agble, Vice Chairman, PSC**

According to Dr. Francis Agble, Information Communication Technology (ICT) means more than the hardware, software and peripherals. It is any movement of information or the use of automation for the movement of data or information. It is a means to help governments all over the world to meet demands on them for more efficient and ethical services.

E-governance is the provision of government goods and services, through the use of cell phones, fax machines, land line telephone, computers and the Internet.

E-governance can take several forms, including government to citizen, citizen to government and government to governments. It can also provide several forms of service, such as:

- access to application forms and permits,
- registration of motor vehicles,
- applying for or renewal of licenses, and
- downloading of forms.

Three key strengths of E-governance are:

- economics (it reduces the cost of government),
- convenience (it permits ease of access), and

- communication (it breaks down the barriers between the citizen and government).

E-governance, however, has some weaknesses. These include:

- negative economic effects, e.g. loss of jobs, large initial investment in the cost of equipment and for maintenance,
- inaccessibility, e.g. not everybody has a computer,
- inadequate security or the perception of inadequate security – e.g. concerns for lack of privacy and how to control unwanted spam.

Currently, in Ghana, there is a partnership with Microsoft for funds to Support teacher training for the next five years, and integrating computer literacy in schools via the Microsoft Academy with a range of Microsoft software.

There are currently 800,000 fixed and mobile telephone lines, and the government is facilitating transparency and the flow of information through an agreement with the International Institute for Communication and Development to enhance the existing national website.

Concluding, Dr. Agble asserted that E-governance will help public administration in Ghana to provide better services to its people. There is therefore the need for a focus on awareness, participation, accessibility, promotion of research and development and increased collaboration.

(B) **PLENARY SESSION 2**

Presiding: Prof. Norman Johnson, Florida A&M University, and Dr. Thomas Alex Donkor, Member, PSC

3.3 (a) **“E-governance as an Instrument for Services Delivery, Public Accountability, and Citizen Empowerment” – Terry Buss, Deputy Vice President, International Programmes, NAPA**

Prof. Terry Buss enumerated the following as the categories of Information Technology:-

- (i) **e-Services** – to deliver government services, information and programmes.

Some of the components are:

- downloading of forms and data input,
- online payments and activities,

(ii) **e-Management** – (to improve management processes); and

(iii) **e-Democracy** – (to facilitate citizens participation).

The components include:

- obtaining citizen feedback (surveys, comments on policy),
- disseminating and assessing information,
- promoting public oversight and accountability,
- expanding the elections and voting option,
- facilitating collective decision-making and

(iv) **e-Commerce** – (to exchange goods and services in the private sector.)

The components are the use of credit cards to transfer money from one location to another, as well as other approaches to processing requisitions, purchase order and invoicing.

Prof Buss also identified the following as some of the IT and Reform Trends:

- Increased globalization;
- Devolution to multi-centred government;
- Improving productivity and cost savings;
- Increased accountability and transparency;
- Accelerated reforms and transformations;
- Stimulating entrepreneurial management; and
- Promoting knowledge management;

(b) **“E-governance as an Instrument for Services Delivery, Public Accountability, and Citizen Empowerment”-Hon. David Gyewu, Deputy Minister for Communications and Technology.**

Defining E-governance as an instrument of service delivery, public accountability and citizen participation, Hon David Gyewu stated that Ghana's vision of E-governance is that modernization must be for the purpose of creating better government to make life better for its citizens. Through ICT, the government can become more efficient and responsive.

The current initiatives in Ghana are therefore designed to ensure that citizens will receive more integrated services; agencies will communicate more effectively with each other; there will be an effective decentralized system of governance, and Ghanaians will be better informed because of access to up-to-date and comprehensive information.

Processes must be reviewed and revised; accountability and responsiveness must become key values in the e-governance system and in the system of governance.

There are, however, a number of challenges in the environment. These include-;

- Organisation;
- Apathy;
- Risk aversion ;
- Disparagement (i.e. lack of rewards and experiencing disparaged treatment);
- Lack of co-ordination;
- Mounting of technology-driven system; and
- Unfettered enthusiasm (i.e. enthusiasm gone awry or out of control).

3.4 (a) **“improving Higher Education through Distance Learning” – Prof. Charlie Nelms, Vice President, Institutional Development, Indiana, University, USA**

Prof. Nelms preceded his presentation with the following statements-:

- Not all movement is progress.
- E-governance is only as effective as the systems and the people who drive it.
- Collaboration and co-operation are essential to move ahead.
- Technology is a means to an end, not an end in itself.
- Education is the best deliverer of us all from where we are to where we want to be. Education is the “real deal” if we are going to make the world a better place.

Prof. Nelms defined “Distance education” as education that takes place when students are separated by space and location, a separation which is bridged by audio tapes, video tapes, satellite up-links and down-links, and online, electronic interaction.

He stressed that there must be a willingness on the part of policy-makers to embrace technology to achieve distance learning. For, through technology, efficiency, effectiveness and access can be improved, but will not necessarily be a savings in money in the short run.

He suggested that Ghana should consider a series of distance learning systems, using a combination of approaches; audiotapes, correspondence, videotapes, and/or the Internet, as appropriate. "Ghana", he said, "must choose which road it will take".

(b) **"Improving Higher Education through Distance Learning" – Rev. Emmanuel K. Dadebo, Co-ordinator, ICT in Education Programmes, Ministry of Education, Youth and Sports, Ghana**

To put his presentation in perspective, Rev. Dadebo incorporated Distance Learning, Distance Education and Open Learning. He distinguished Distance Learning from Distance Education. In Distance Learning, the learner is the principal evaluator of his or her learning; the learner sets his or her own pace, and chooses the venue of learning.

Two **key prerequisites** to the Distance Learning Initiative in Ghana are:-

- there must be a vision; and
- a clear vision must be followed by a mission. In Ghana, the mission is to have quality education of all forms and at all levels, available to all.

Among the **objectives for distance education** are the following:-

- To increase access to and participation in education.
- To democratize education so as to make it possible for the under-served groups in society to have equal opportunity to education;
- To make the acquisition of education so flexible that workers can conveniently combine their studies with family life; and
- To foster a culture of lifelong learning among the citizenry.

The need for training is borne by the statistics on the illiteracy rate in Ghana which stands at about 25%. For example, Secondary education enrollment is only 3% for the relevant age groups.

The **critical challenges** for Ghana, are that:

- There must be an acknowledgement by Government of the need for the people to be trained (not educated); and
- There must be specific commitment by the government to deal with the relationship between those who are economically active and those who are not, from the perspective of making people more economically independent.

Rev. Dadebo asserted that certain benefits will accrue from the utilization of ICT as a delivery model for Distance Learning. Indeed, Distance Learning will be primarily driven by ICT. There is therefore the need to:

- Build a critical mass of IT students at all levels in the educational system;

- Develop e-schools and community initiatives to drive all ICT education programme in schools; and
- Develop and put in place infrastructure where there is currently no electricity, no computers and little knowledge of computers among teachers.

He suggested that there must be a collaboration with Intel, Microsoft and other agencies to help get the needed external support in meeting the equipment infrastructure need to drive the Ghana E-Schools initiatives. The establishment of relations with Sysco Corp and Intel Corp will also help in content analysis of e-education.

3.5 (a) **“African Executives Web-Based Network for Effective Governance”- Prof. Johnson Nkuuhe**

Prof. Philip Rutledge explained that Dr. Johnson Nkuuhe was not able to make it to the Colloquium because he had to attend to other equally pressing duties at the United Nations. Dr. Nkuuhe however, wanted to place on record that there had been a number of changes with respect to Exec Net since November, 2003. NAPA was asked to monitor the website for Exec Net.

Prof Rutledge recognized Dr. Francis Agble, Dr. Harvey White and Dr. Sylvester Murray for their contribution to the development of Exec Net. He discussed some of the purposes of Exec Net, its membership requirement and the role of NAPA and its activities relating to Exec Net.

Dr. Harvey White stressed the need to appropriately recognize individual Ghanaians who participated in the founding of Exec Net, while Dr. Agble invited those who had interest in Exec Net to contact him for information from the website.

(b) **“African Executives Web-Based Network for Effective Governance”- Mrs. Estelle Akofio-Sowah, Managing Director, Busy Internet**

Mrs. Akofio-Sowah indicated that two of the principal objectives of the African Executives Network were shared lessons and innovations and increased interactions among the Executives.

One of the **challenges** facing the Network is that of communication, generally, amongst African executives. Examples are:-

- Language barrier.
- High communication cost.
- Poor access to information.
- Vast geography; and
- Lack of trust.

Some of the **benefits** of the web-based network include:-

- Improved information access.
- Improved flow of communication, which should have an impact on the governance process.

Weak information access makes impact on government more difficult. Therefore the two key strategies in African Network Development are that it must be African-led and, it must use technology, and not be technology-driven.

The use of ICT should lead to an increase in access to, and an improvement in, government processes. In this respect, she suggested the following:-

- **Drum and Dance** – we must make sure we do not forget tradition as we embrace ICT.
- **Mentors** - we must employ mentors to work with young people.
- The reality is **limited time** – we have become micro managers, paying attention to minor details. African Executives should find time to do networking.
- **Sustainability** – we must be able to sustain improvements and development.

4.0

SUMMARY OF REACTOR PANEL DISCUSSIONS / PRESENTATIONS

Dr. Lenneal Henderson, NAPA Fellow

Dr. Henderson stressed the need to-:

- (a) ask what ends or values we wish to pursue;
- (b) address the economic situation, which begins with consideration of the extent to which we collect data and have basic information about our citizens;
- (c) focus on human capital investment and specialized training; and
- (d) address our social capital (people needs) and our structural capital (infrastructural needs) to get the outcomes we want).

There is also the need for participants to address the issue of how e-governance evaluates itself.

Dr. Enid Beaumont, NAPA Fellow

Dr. Enid Beaumont cautioned participants not to put an “E” in front of everything, unless they knew what they wanted, or anticipated from the thing that the “E” was modifying. According to her, there was an obligation to determine how we would use the people who would be affected by the incorporation of ICT.

Dr. Kofi Agyeman Badu, Dean of Graduate Studies, GIMPA

Prof. Badu stressed the need to use technology to improve processes, to make decentralization more effective by, for example, meeting simple business needs by doing them online; using the Internet as an effective tool for communication; and making computers talk to each other, through the establishment of Local Area Networks (LANs).

Prof. Mitchell Rice ,Texas A & M University, USA.

Prof Rice referred to words with the “E” prefix: e-commerce, e-medicine, e-management, e-human resources, e-services, e-democracy, e-schools and e-governance.

He cautioned Ghanaians not to move too fast until they are e-ready, the conditions of which are-:

- (a) Protection of private property rights;
- (b) Basic freedoms;
- (c) Minimum governmental interference in the market place;

- (d) Government transparency; and
- (e) Existing educational infrastructure to up –grade skills in the area of communications and technology.

The issue of how the poor and uneducated will benefit from wide-range acceptance of an ICT approach also has to be addressed. According to him, research shows that the more ICT is used, those who use it benefit most.

He noted that some have opined that since the poor do not have it, they are not being hurt. In his view, however, if the poor are already a part of the economic gap, when you add an emphasis on technology, they are further disadvantaged. Therefore, the poor and the uneducated must be addressed.

Mrs. Vivian Attah, Acting Director, GIMPA Distance Learning Centre

Mrs. Attah noted that the model of service delivery and E-governance suggested was a top-down model. There was the need to consider the bottom-up model as well.

Distance learning has been with Ghana with, at least three centers currently in operation. There is the need to take another look at location.

In her opinion, the issue of getting the young involved in public service is an important one. Public Administration should therefore be introduced early in the system.

Mrs. Attah also advised that Exec Net should be accessible on the Ghanaian website and should be public; that is, it should not require membership to access it. The needs of all stakeholders should be taken into account.

Mrs. Leonora Kyerematen, National Co-ordinator, National Governance Programme.

Mrs. Kyerematen observed that the National Governance Programme in Ghana has worked with the Ministry of Finance and Economic Planning, various Commissions and public service organizations/agencies and the newly-created Office of Accountability. Efforts are being made to extend assistance to the Magistrate Courts to enhance increased access to speedy justice. The Programme also provides support to civil society organizations.

Mrs. Kyerematen mentioned the following on-going projects;

- The ADP initiative which offers a platform for sharing information;
- The African Virtual University web portal which provides reports from all governments in Central Africa.

There are a number of challenges requiring to be addressed urgently. These include the absence of training, the capacity of the human resource, and access to information.

Prof. William Dodge, NAPA

Prof. Dodge noted that Ghana is implementing a new governance system of which the Ministry of Local Government and Rural Development is the implementing agency. The District Assemblies are the key to decentralization and to an effective e-governance system.

Prof. Dodge observed that the main problem is the difficulty of communication in the Districts. The Districts, for example, cannot download best practices, and they are unable to communicate effectively, as landlines are occasionally down.

Funds from the Millennium Challenge Account could be a possible answer to this problem.

5.0 **LUNCHEON PRESENTATION**

The luncheon presentation was delivered by Dr. Alfred Salia Fawundu, the United Nations Resident Representative in Ghana. He stated that E-governance is a tool that will become an instrument to govern our way of life. According to him, “E” is a means to an end, which is “**governance**”, the conduct of public affairs, the delivery of services of government. Governance has such attributes as accountability, transparency, access, inclusion, rule of law and integrity.

Dr. Fawundu observed further that ICT initiative is driving the private sector in many countries. The sector uses ICT more than the public sector. E-Governance is therefore but a small sector of ICT. Ghanaians in both the public and private sectors are the force behind the evolution. The speed, he asserted, is too fast, and is making the PSC and others to be a “dinosaur” . He suggested that a way should be found to place the PSC in the ICT Plan, and that everything should be done to have the bandwidth to achieve ICT at the level we aspire to do.

6. **SUMMARY OF DISCUSSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS BY BREAK-OUT GROUPS**

Six break-out groups met separately to discuss selected topics. Each group was required to focus the discussion on the issues under consideration and make specific recommendations. The report of each group was presented by the group's Rapporteur.

Group A - **Topic: "Governance and Sustainable Development"**

Leaders: Dr Suellen Keiner, Vice President, and General Counsel, NAPA
and
Dr. Kofi Agyeman-Badu, Dean of Graduate Studies, GIMPA

Resource Person: Keysha Webb, US Department of Defense

Rapporteurs: Prof. Michael Gordon, Professor, Indiana University and Mr. Mike K. Gabah, Secretary, PSC.

Task: To review the general landscape of E-governance, and its potential contribution in sustainable development.

Discussion: The group discussed several issues derived from the framework of analysis – namely, economic prosperity, social equity and environmental protection. Key issues addressed included the following:-

- a) Technology transfer – computer usage with respect to the computer as a management tool.
- b) Training in the use of computer technology: training across the board, of managers, senior executives and junior staff.
- c) Information sharing, dissemination of information, and area networking across government organizations and agencies.
- d) Adequate funding for the acquisition of hardware, software and training.
- e) Capacity building at all levels of government.
- f) The establishment of a comprehensive database to track activities in various sectors of the society and also ensure effective planning and decision –making, e.g. the environment, education.

g) The “model” developed by the Ministry of Energy for computer networking and integration may be studied for adoption as a benchmark for other agencies in Ghana.

5.2 **Group B** - **“Administrative Issues in E-Governance”**

Leaders: Louis Picard, Professor, University of Pittsburgh
and
Mrs. Jemima H. Quaye, Member, PSC

Resource Person: Pauline Greenlick, Education Consultant

Rapporteurs: John Saunders, Executive Director, NFBPA
Kwaku D. Dankwa, Director (HRPD), PSC

Task:

Discussion: The Group made the following recommendations:

5.3 **Group C** - **“Strategic Planning, Local and Regional Governance”**

Leaders: Harlan Hobgood, Senior Fellow, NAPA
and
Francis Appiah, Executive Secretary, National APRM Secretariat, Ministry of Regional Cooperation and NEPAD

Resource Person: Joyce Henderson, Strategic Planning Consultant

Rapporteurs: Carolyn Graham, Deputy Mayor, Washington DC
W.A. Botchway, Director (F&A), PSC

Task: Identify implementation issues – problems/ opportunities, etc. – relating to how the techniques and processes of e-governance can be used to support both the decentralization and devolution of District Assemblies, and promote interaction between the distribution levels of the public services. How cost-effective ways (information technology and electronic data processing) can be developed to support information dissemination within the District Assemblies to ensure public involvement in planning, budgeting, tendering and the legislative processes.

Discussions: The Group identified the following implementation opportunities:

- a) development of a 5-year plan around organizations;
- b) identification and organization of local capacity by organizing the private religious, NGOs, etc sector (e.g. The banks/financial institutions, educational institutes engineering/architectural institutions) etc;
- c) Investing in training, development of standards, procedures and systems of accountability to effect the proper transfer of resources, both human and financial;
- d) Assessment of uneven distribution of resources between functions;
- e) Galvanizing resources for proper and equitable distribution;
- f) Development of action plans that recognize the incremental nature of the decentralization process;
- g) Looking for unlikely partners and/or involving agencies and constituents in the re-designing efforts;

- h) Development of peer collaborative processes between District Officers; and
- i) Using technology to effect necessary dialogue between and within Districts.

5.4 **Group D** - **“Workforce Capacity Building”**

Leaders: Prof. Terry Buss, Deputy Vice President, NAPA
and
Ms. Dorothy K. Gordon, Director-General, Ghana-India Kofi Annan Centre of Excellence in ICT

Resource Person: Melvin Foote, President &CEO, Constituency for Africa

Rapporteur: Dr. Frances Michalkewicz, Principal, NAPA Africa Working Group
Mr. K. Obeng-Fosu, Deputy Director, PSC

Task: Initiate discussion on the electronic use of demographic data sets: labour force and economic trends, innovative recruitment, training and educational strategies, capacity building for meeting future workforce requirements for environmental protection, and sustainable development.

Discussions: The following views were advanced by members of the group:-

- a) care should be taken not to over-invest in Information Technology equipment. This is to ensure that the number of computers procured matches trained personnel available to use them;
- b) Workers to be made redundant as a result of the introduction of the computer should be re-trained to perform other jobs;
- c) The procurement of IT materials for training should be made from local software companies to ensure their conformity with local standards and needs.
- d) Consultants selected for the training of workers should understand/appreciate the training needs of the organization. Furthermore, adequate provision should be made in the consultancy agreement to ensure that proper handing-over of the new skills/equipment is done.

- e) A civil or public service Information Technology training school/centre should be established to train the workers to perform specific jobs.

5.5 **Group E** - **“Issues in Information Technology Management”**

Leaders: Costis Toregas, President, PTI
and
Esther Ofei-Aboagye, Acting Director, ILGS

Resource Person: Leah Davis, Doctoral Researcher, Indiana University

Rapporteurs: Valerie Lemmie, City Manager, City of Cincinnati
Romeo Adu-Tutu, Deputy Director, PSC

Task: The group was to identify ways of improving capacity for internal and external information sharing within and among different levels of government; professional processing, records management, better service delivery and more responsive communication with citizens and community-based organizations regarding public service management in Ghana.

Discussions: The group identified the following as some of the barriers to the procurement/acquisition of ICT.

- a) Many Procurement Officers and managers do not have adequate technical knowledge to buy the most suitable/appropriate equipment.
- b) Purchase decision-making tend not to involve younger staff with better knowledge of ICT equipment and their usage.
- c) Very limited inter-agency co-operation/consultation on purchases and/or sharing of networks to save cost.
- d) Decision on the purchase of ICT equipment are driven largely by funding considerations, and less by the needs of the organization.

The following recommendations were made:

- a) Alternating and Retention of ICT personnel:
continuous training and commitment;
- b) agencies commitment and resources for training:
- best practice exchange among agencies;
- web-based training.
- c) Require Agency Executives to have ICT training:
- performance-based contracts should be encouraged by agencies.

- d) Upward review of ICT budgets;
- e) Borrowing from vendors to reduce the annual capital outlay for hardware

5.6 **Group F** - **“Performance Measures for Upper Management Personnel”**

Leaders: Prof. Mitchell Rice, Professor, Texas A&M University
and
Dr. Alex Glover-Quartey, Head of Civil Service

Resource Person: Cynthia Chertos, Human Resource Consultant

Rapporteurs: Prof. George Assibey-Mensah, Professor, Indiana University
Mr. Dan Sam, Director (MSD), PSC

Task: The identification of techniques and strategies to improvement and personnel management practices, including policies, procedures and activities that may assist in human capital formation and sustainable development in and among public service agencies.

Discussions: The group identified the following as some of the performance measures that a manager may use to make his employees put up their best:

- a) incentives, professional allowance, and training.
- b) Rewards and recognition – e.g. citation and certificates.
- c) Bonuses.
- d) Physical factors – e.g. bigger offices, carpeting, parking space, etc.
- e) High flyer system.

The group considered that some of the results of low salaries and remuneration were corruption, brain drain, high turn-over to the private sector and low morale among workers. It accordingly recommended that this issue of low salaries, particularly in the Civil Service, should be addressed dispassionately and urgently.

7. QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS SESSION

7.1 **Ms. Dorothy K. Gordon**, Director-General of the Ghana-India Kofi Annan Centre for Excellence in ICT, suggested that open sources for the design of software should be sought. It would be wrong to assume that every Ghanaian is literate, or can speak English. She suggested further that other communication techniques, such as videos and audios must be looked at. ICT, she said, can create wealth in the rural areas and also help to prepare Chief Executive Officers and managers to take the right decisions.

7.2 A question by **Dr. Harvey White**, a NAPA delegate, with respect to the African Virtual University elicited the following response:

(a) the African Virtual University (AVU) is an interactive-instructional telecommunications network established to serve the countries of Africa.

(b) the objective of the AVU is to build capacity and support economic development for leveraging the power of modern telecommunications technology to provide world-class quality education and training programmes to students and professionals in Africa.

(c) the AVU has been transformed from a World Bank project to an independent, reputable inter-governmental organisation based in Nairobi, Kenya, with over 34 Learning Centres in 17 of the 53 African countries.

7.3 **Mrs. Estelle Akofio-Sowah**, Managing Director of Busy Internet, Accra, said she was aware of only one mentoring programme in Ghana. He indicated, however, that the University of Ghana, Legon, can help in this direction.

Mrs. Akofio-Sowah suggested that executives should consider adopting 10 to 20 students for mentoring. She also noted that most of the rural communities of Ghana do not have video satellite and ISPs.

Mrs. Akofio-Sowah was complimented for what she is doing in the field of ICT.

7.4 Participants stressed the need to put emphasis on the Importance of the Human Capital. It was the view that selection criteria for managers should be used to get the right attitudes. There is no room for arrogance in managers. Only people who run organizations can set forth their values.

8. **SUMMATION**

- 8.1 The presentation of Reports of the Rapporteurs and Summation Session was presided over jointly by Dr. Charles Washington, Dean, Clark Atlanta University, USA and Dr. Francis Agble, Vice Chairman of the PSC.
- 8.2 The session was devoted to general discussions of the reports and recommendations as presented above.

9. **CLOSING CEREMONY**

- 9.1 The Closing Remarks were made by Prof. Samuel N. Woode, Chairman of the Public Services Commission (PSC). Dr. Valerie Lemmie, Board Chair of NAPA gave a response on behalf of the NAPA Delegates. Prof. Philip Rutledge wrapped up with the Colloquium and Consultations details.
- 9.2 Participants and Delegates were allowed to give general individual votes of thanks after which the Colloquium was declared formally closed.

